Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh
Cabinet Division

An Independent Review of National Integrity Strategy (NIS)[1]

May 2013

Table of Contents

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ACC	Anti-Corruption Commission
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
AG	Attorney General
CID	Criminal Investigation Department
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DFID	Department for International Development
EC	Election Commission
ECNIAC	Executive Committtee of the National Integrity Advisory Council
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IDRA	Insurance Development and Regulatory Authority
IT	Information Technology
IPD	Improving Democracy through Parliamentary Development
JATI	Judicial Administration Training Institute
LGD	Local Government Division
LGI	Local Government Institution
NIAC	National Integrity Advisory Council
NIS	National Integrity Strategy
NIIU	National Integrity Implementation Unit
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NGOAB	NGO Affairs Bureau
OCAG	Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General
PAC	Public Accounts Committee
PSA	Public Servant Act
PSC	Public Service Commission
RPO	Representation of People's Order
TIB	Transparency International Bangladesh
UISC	Union Information and Service Centres
UNCAC	United Nations Convention against Corruption
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme

Executive Summary

THE CONTEXT

1.   The concerns for ethics and standards in public life, and strategies to control corruption are now almost global and central to democratic governance and management of public services (OECD, 1999 & 2000; Hoddes et al., 2001). There are now growing recognitions in governments all over the world to integrate measures for fighting corruption into their governance agenda.

2.   The present government of Bangladesh has taken the challenge of combatting corruption seriously as part of its election pledge implementation since it came to the power in 2009. Accordingly, it has shown concerns for collectively fighting corruption and fixing it firmly on the agenda of policy makers in state and non-state institutions in order to create avenues for overcoming the barriers. Through a process of wide-ranging stakeholder consultations, the Government approved the *National Integrity Strategy (NIS)* in October 2012. NIS has a comprehensive set of goals, strategies and action plans aimed at increasing the level of independence, accountability, efficiency, transparency and effectiveness of the state and non-state institutions to improve governance and reduce corruption in a holistic manner.

THE STUDY

3.   The current study - an independent review of *the National Integrity Strategy (NIS)* implementation - has been commissioned by the Cabinet Division of the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh with support from the Asian Development Bank (ADB) under TA-4983 BAN: Supporting the Good Governance Programme of Asian Development Bank (ADB). There are two specific objectives of the study : i) to make an independent assessment of all relevant actions and/or recommendations under different institutions as mentioned in the approved NIS document, and ii) to focus on the outcomes of NIS implementation at all levels of the Government, accountability institutions, and civil society and private sectors. Importantly, the research for this review has been based on *Focused Synthesis Method* complemented by *Focus Group Discussions* FGD)*.*

OBSERVATIONS AND FINDINGS

4.   The study notices that the NIS has successfully addressed the comprehensive and technical issues, for instance, it has put in place the right legal, institutional and administrative arrangements and procedures that can enable and support transparency and accountability in public office-holders and institutions. In addtion, the NIS has equally highlighted the role of non-state intitutions in fighting corruption and upheld the importance of providing leadership, rooting out corruption and tailoring sustainable results.

5.   The study, however, reveals that making the state organs and Constitutional and major statutory bodies dedicated to combating corruption requires strong political and legal commitments, social compliance and administrative enforcement mechanisims, and administrative as well as policy reforms.[2]

6.   The study also reveals that overseeing and ensuring integrity of the NGOs, civil society organisations and civil society itself[3] and reviewing and monitoring the activities with respect to integrity of the business, commerce and industrial establishments of the private sector are two major challenges that the NGO Affairs Bureau and the Ministry of Commerce are faced with respectively.

7.   The study identifies that the mass media, educational institutions, and family need to be mainstreamed in the national integrity building so as to produce durable results and bridging the youth leadership with a high sense of integrity and dedication to fighting corruption, which is a great challenge given the fact that it requires vast civic awareness and trust building to the government initiatives and a visionary commitment of the civil society and the government.

8.   Importantly, the study supports that NIS is a comprehensive and living strategy paper. One of its unique strengths is flexibility – the document is allowed to be reviewed and updated from time to time. NIS has intended to reach the country to a new paradigm. Functions, performances, evolution, the present status and challenges for each of the identified institutions and organisations have been presented briefly in this stategy paper, and required action plans have been proposed. It has also documented all necessary supportive arrangements and has given special importance to the need for coordinating the actions of these institutions and taking reform initiatives to have a synergic effect.

9.   The progress of NIS implementation made so far is satisfatory enough given the time period since it got approved. Suceess has been made in a number of areas, for instance, National Integrity Implementation Unit (NIIU), National Integrity Advisory Council (NIAC) and Executive Committtee of t National Integrity Advisory Council (ECNIAC) have been formed, and a letter has been issued from the National Integrity Implementation Unit of Cabinet Division for forming Ethics Committees at all Ministries/Divisions of the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh and Constitutional and Statutrory Bodies. Most of the Ministries and institutions have formed 'Ethics Committee' by this time.

---

[2] Importanly, a strong commitment from the Prime Minister is evident with the approval of the National Integrity Strategy, formation of the National Integrity Advisory Council (NIAC) as well as Executive Committee of the National Integrity Advisory Council (ECNIAC). What is required now is collective commitment and political consensus for national integrity building.

[3] According to the NIAC meeting resolution, integrity activities of NGOs and civil society organisations other than foreign-aid-supported ones need to be reviewed and monitored by the concerned Ministries/Divisions.

10.   In addtion, National Integrity Advisory Council at its first meeting on 28th March 2013 took the following key decisions:

- Formation of Ethics Committees and approval of their Terms of Reference;

- Development of modality for reviewing and monitoring integrity activities of civil society organisations and NGOs, and private industrial and commercial sector;

- Priority selection for implementation;

- Launching a massive campaign to enhance public awareness about NIS and uphold its spitritamong the people; and Monitoring the implementation of decisions of the National Integrity Advisory Council by the Executive Committee

11.   The NIAC meeting also identified three priorities with regard to NIS implementation:

a. Drafting, passing and enactment of Attorney Service Act;

b. Appointment of Ombudsman and establishment of his office; and

c. Development of Law/Rules/Guidelines for appointment of judges of the Supreme Court.

12.   Furthermore,   in-depth   interviews   of   senior   representatives   from   relevent Ministries/Divisions   and constitutional and statutory bodies suppported by review of office memo, meeting resolution, Acts/laws, rules/guidelines, reports and other documents indicate that a significant progress has been made possible in certain areas within the 6-month period since the NIS got approved *(see Chapter III).*

RECOMMENDATIONS

13.   To help the identified government agencies at national level work for curbing corruption, the following approaches may be undertaken:

- A broad political consensus for sustained commitment towards NIS implementation;

- Improved media partnership and media engagement, effective dialogues in the form of seminars and roundtables with participation of political stakeholders, civil soiciety representatives, private sector, media and bureaucrats both in terms of scale and magnitude of quality and visibility; and

- Consolidating rule of law through strenthening the judiciary in terms of institutional capacity enhancement including undertaking a series of judicial studies. It may also include organization of seminars and symposiams on the role of judiciary; putting in place an elaborate system for recruitment of supreme court judges and enhanncing the

judicial oversight and enforcement mechanisims, for instance and scaling up case review by the academia and the media.

14.   Mainstreaming the mass media, educational institutions and the family into the process of national integrity building and fighting corruption involve rigorous civic and parental education, community awareness, teaching civic virtue at school and media campaign programmes. Research, for instance, Gyimath-Boadi (2004:3) reveals that it is difficult to sustain anti-corruption reforms without effective public/civic education.

15.   In addtion, Information Commission and Human Rights Commission need to be incorporated in National Integrity Strategy with identifying their goals and action plans as core national integrity agencies. The provision of integrity awards and rewarding sytem, as reflected in the National Integrity Strategy, needs to be operational in a full-fledged mode.

16.   In reviewing and monitoring the integrity measures of the commercial and industrial establishments of the private sector, the Ministry of Commerce may be encouraged to extensively engage with different Associations and Chambers in the form of consultations, shared decision-making, preparation of guidelines, establishment of enforcement mechanism, policy-making and shared monitoring.

17.   The NGO Affairs Bureau which is responsible for overseeing the activities of NGOs may be encouraged to strengthen civil-society consultations, shared decision-making and joint monitoring.

I. Introduction

The Context

18.   Corruption poses a serious goverance, corporate and development challenge all over the world. In general, corruption erodes the institutional capacity of governments and ruins democratic values, discourages investment, undermines fair competition, increases business operational costs, discards corporate reputation, diverts essential public resources away from their rational uses and damages development efforts which all together impose direct costs on society and enhance the sufferings of the mass-people. Apart from this, in today's world, there are crucial links between corruption and human rights violation, poverty, exclusion, environmental degradation, vulnerability and conflict.

19.   The concerns for ethics and standards in public life, and strategies to control corruption are now almost global and central to democratic governance and management of public services (OECD, 1999 & 2000; Hoddes et al., 2001). There are now growing recognitions in governments all over the world including Bangladesh to integrate measures for fighting corruption to their governance agenda.

20.   The present government of Bangladesh took it seriously as part of implementation of its election pledge since it came into the power in 2009, and accordingly stressed back to the concern to collectively fight corruption and fix it firmly on the agenda of policy makers in state and non-state institutions so as to create avenues for overcoming the barriers. The Government approved the *National Integrity Strategy (NIS)* in October 2012 through a process of wide-ranging stakeholder consultations. NIS has a comprehensive set of goals, strategies and action plans aimed at increasing the level of independence, accountability, efficiency, transparency and effectiveness of state and non-state institutions for improving governance and reducing corruption in a holistic manner.

21.   Importantly, Cabinet Division has been implementing *Supporting the Good Governance Programme* of Asian Development Bank (ADB) since 2007. The basic objective of the project is to strengthen legal, policy and institutional structure as means of fighting corruption, building national integrity and ensuring good governance. One of the 47 policy conditions of the project is to review implementation progress of *National Integrity Strategy (NIS).* Now review of the implementation progress of NIS is apparent to be a priority of Cabinet Division given the mandate of the *Supporting the Good Governance Programme* and the fact that the project is going to be completed in June 2013. The *Programme*, however, made a preliminary study available in January 2012 on the draft NIS.
.

National Integrity Strategy (NIS)

22.   NIS has a comprehensive set of goals, strategies and action plans aimed at increasing the level of independence, accountability, efficiency, transparency and effectiveness of state and non-state institutions for improving governance and reducing corruption in a holistic manner.

23.   Following are the vision and mission of this strategy paper:

> *Vision -* *A happy-prosperous Golden Bengal.*
>
> *Mission -* *Establishment of good governance in state institutions and society.*

24.   The 'Perspective Plan, 2021' through putting a high importance to prevention of corruption, has promised to launch a movement in this regard. The Government has formulated this 'National Integrity Strategy' to fulfill that commitment effectively.[4]

25.   This Strategy has been formulated with a view to preventing corruption and establishing integrity in the State and society in Bangladesh. Proposals have been made for capacity development of important institutions and organisations of the state, civil society and the private sector. Action plans have been tailored to implement the strategy through existing laws, rules, systems and their reforms and in some cases promulgation of new laws and rules. In the action plans, implementation periods have been proposed as short-term (within one year), medium-term (within three years), and long-term (within five years) measures. The state institutions identified for this purpose are: (1) Executive organ and Public Administration, (2) Parliament, (3) Judiciary, (4) Election Commission, (5) Attorney-General, (6) Public Service Commission, (7) Comptroller and Auditor-General, (8) Ombudsman, (9) Anti-Corruption Commission, and (10) Local Government Institutions. In addition, the non-state organisations covered in this strategy are (1) political parties, (2) industrial and commercial organisations in the private sector, (3) NGOs and civil society, (4) family, (5) educational institutions, and (6) media.

26.   The institutions noted above are working to prevent corruption and to enhance integrity in their respective jurisdictions. Although NIS was recently approved by the Government, its recommendations for different accountability institutions have been evolving and are in different stages of implementation.

Arrangement of the Report

27.   Following the abbreviations and acronyms, and executive summary, Chapter-I of the report deals with introduction focusing on contextual analysis and glimpses of the *National*

---

[4] This strategy is a living document and will provide flexibility for adopting new action plans and implemention scopes as time passes and necessity arises.

Integrity Strategy (NIS). Chapter-II designs the study in line with the terms of reference, goal and objectives of the study and the study methodology, while Chapter-III manifests the basic findings of the study with chapter title *NIS implementation progress and outcomes,* and subtitles *implementation arrangement, p*rogress *in implementatio*n *arrangement, outcomes revealed by FGDs and progress in relation to NIS implementation and outcomes*. Finally, Chapter-IV concludes the report crafting some feasible recommendations and a conclusion. At the end of the report, there are Appendices and References.

II. The Study

Goal and Objectives of the Study

28.   The study aims to conduct the independent review or assessment of *the National Integrity Strategy (NIS)* implementation, under *Supporting the Good Governance Programme*, of the Cabinet Division, Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.

29.   The objective of the study is to review the outcomes of NIS implementation at all levels of the Government including the role of accountability institutions, civil society and private sectors.

*30.   Terms of Reference of the study is shown in **Appendix-1.***

Methodology

31.   The research for this review is based on *Focused Synthesis Method*[5] complemented by *Focus Group Discussion.* The *Focused Synthesis* includes desk review of existing relevent documents,[6] indepth interview of state and non-state agency heads or partinent representatives (*see **Appendix 2***), and social and professional media observation; while the *Focus Group Discussion (FGD)*[7] captures public perception about civic virtue, NIS implementation progress at family, school level, anti-corruption movements and their outcomes at all levels of the Government, non-government and private sectors. The *Research Plan* is attached at ***Appendix-4.***

III.   NIS Implementation Progress and Outcomes

---

[5] Focused Synthesis allows collecting and documenting information as well as data from a range of sources as diverse literature review, researcher's personal experience, web and media evidence, legislative hearing, court verdict, staff memorandum, unpublished project or study document, anecdotal evidence and story, citation or discussion with experts, practitioners and stakeholders (Talukdar, 2012).

[6] Relevent documents indicate approved NIS, previous appraisal or review study, contemporary scholarly aticiles on the issue partculrly on the Bangladesh context, relevent published and/or unpublished materials from state and non-state agencies, project documents, staff memoranda.

[7] FGD included representatives from households/families, schools and religious institutions (*see **Appendix- 3***).

Implementation Arrangement

32.   The National Integrity Strategy is to be implemented mainly by the executive organ of the State. Actions for two other organs of the State – the judiciary and the legislature – as well as the constitutional and statutory bodies have also been proposed. The executive organ helps these institutions implement the prescribed action plans with necessary assistance and resources. The government supports implementation of the action plans in the civil society as well as   industrial and commercial organisations by enacting regulatory, enabling laws and monitoring them. The NGO Affairs Bureau and the Ministry of Commerce review and monitor the activities with respect to integrity of the NGOs, and industrial establishments of the private sector respectively.

33.   NIS prescribes that a `National Integrity Advisory Council' would be established for implementation of this Strategy. The Council would be headed by the Prime Minister and composed of selected Cabinet members, legislators, Cabinet Secretary and some other Secretaries, representatives of Constitutional and statutory bodies and representatives of civil society, media and the private sector. The Advisory Council is supposed to meet at least twice a year and review the performances and progresses with respect to integrity, monitor them and give directives for their promotion. The Council may have an Executive Committee for conveniences of work.

34.   The interventions necessary under this Strategy should be implemented in a decentralised manner. In each Ministry/Division, an 'Ethics Committee' would be formed and an 'Integrity Focal Point' needs to be nominated for this purpose. The Administrative Reforms and Implementation Wing of the Cabinet Division acts as the Secretariat for this institutional arrangement and coordinates the activities under this Strategy.

Progress in Implementation Arrangement

35.   The progress of NIS implementation arrangement made so far is satisfatory given the time period since it got approved. Suceess has been made in a number of areas, for instance, National Integrity Implementation Unit (NIIU), National Integrity Advisory Council (NIAC) and Executive Committtee of the National Integrity Advisory Council (ECNIAC) have been formed (see *Appendix 5 & 6*).

36.   In addtion, National Integrity Advisory Council at its first meeting on 28th March 2013 took following key decisions:

> • Formation of Ethics Committees in each Ministry/Division and NIS institutions and their Terms of Reference;

> • Modality of reviewing and monitoring of integrity activities of civil society organizations and NGOs, and private industrial and commercial sector;

- Priority setting of NIS implementation;

- Undertaking massive popular campaign and public awareness for NIS message and spitrit to reach people; and

- Monitoring the implementation of decisions of the National Integrity Advisory Council by the Executive Committee.

37.   A clarifiction of NIS on the role of NGO Affairs Bureau regarding review and monitoring of   integrity activities of NGOs is noted in the NIAC meeting resolution: The NGO Affairs Bureau is authorised to review and monitor the activities with respect to integrity of the foreign-aid-supported NGOs and civil society organisations, whereas integrity activities of NGOs and civil society organisations not receiving any foreign aid need to be reviewed and monitored by the concerned Ministries/Divisions with which they are registered.

38.   The NIAC meeting also identified three priorities with regards to NIS implementation:

   a.   Drafting, passing and enacting the Attorney Service Act;

   b.   Appointment of Ombudsman and establishment of his office;

   c.   Formulation of Law/Rules/Guidelines for appointment of judges of the Supreme Court

39.   Furthermore,   indepth   interviews   of   senior   representatives   from   relevent Ministries/Divisions and constitutional and statutory bodies suppported by official documents such as memo, meeting resolution, Acts/laws, rules/guidelines, reports and other documents indicate that a significant progress has been made in certain areas within the 6-month period since the NIS got approved.

Outcomes Revealed by FGDs

40.   FGDs reveal that family and eduactional institutions can help inculcate civic virtue, patriotism and integrity among new generation. Some of the schools and colleges highly emphasised the need for promoting integrity and civic virtue at educational institutions. The study acknowledges their exemplary appraoches to help students grow up with integrity.

41.   FGDs also   cppture ublic perception of   corruption. According to FGDsfindings, corruption is a governace challenge for the country, which deprives people, affects pro-poor development, and results in social injustice, frustration, unrest and crime. FGDs, however, acknowledge that government alone cannot solve the problem. It requires collective and systematic actions. Importantly, the present government has taken some noteworthy steps for fighting corruption. Legal and strategic reforms, access to information, free press and citizen journalism, e-governance and use of ICT for fighting corruption and political desire and responsiveness, for example, have enhanced civic confidence in the government in its initiatives for combating corruption*.*

Progress in Relation to NIS Outcomes

A. State Institutions and Organisations

1. Executive Organ and Public Administration

42.   NIS goal in relation to *Executive Organ and Public Administration* is to make executive organ transparent and responsive to the demands and needs of people. Given this goal NIS identifies some short, medium and long term recommendations for the *Executive Organ and Public Administration*. Important progresses made so far with those recommendations are noted hereunder:

Income and Asset Statements

43.   Interviewing the concerned officials, the current study notices that the interim government in 2008 made a provision for regular submission (after every five years) <u>of</u> income and asset statement of elected and appointed executives to specified authorities. The current government in 2009 made available a comprehensive and complied asset and liability statement of public officials. Another round of income and asset statement submission for public executives was due in December 2012.

44.   However, disclosure of asset and liabilities or submission of asset statement is not enough with regard to tackling corruption. Preparation of comprehensive statement followed by compliance and enforcement mechanisms is very crucial here.

Whistle Blowers Protection Act

45.   Whistle Blowers' (Protection) Act, 2011 was passed and published in the gazette; it has now come into force to protect whistle-blowers and encourage them to disclose information to the authorities concerned.

Grievance Handling System

46.   The study supports that each public office has a grievance handling focal point, and he is publicly known. A manual grievance handling approach has been in operation since 2011, and an ICT-based sytem was made available and working in pilot basis which needs to be made fully functional.   Various circulars were issued from the Cabinet Division to streamline the grievance redress system at different times. Moreover, monthly progress reports are generated to record the status of grievance handling.

Introduction of E-Governance at Public Service

47.   It was one of the election pledges of the current government. Information and communication technology (ICT) has been introduced and used in all Ministries/Divisions, and the volume and quality of public service continue to be increased and improved by use of ICT. Yet, in practice, use of ICT and its implications and outcomes are visible in the public administration.

48.   The aforementioned significant progresses in the implementation of recomendations related to executive organ and the public administration have made the public service to a great

extent purpose-oriented. ***Table 3.1*** shows a comprehensive picture of the implementation progress of *Action Plan* in relation to recommendations made for *Executive Organ and Public Administration.*

Table 3.1 Executive Organ and Public Administration: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicator	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	Remarks	Source
1	Enactment of Whistle Blowers' (Protection) Act, 2011	Law published in the Gazette	Implemented	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	Cabinet Division	**Achieved**	Act is being implemented	Gazette and Interview
2	Introduction of participatory appraisal system	Newly formulated system followed	Short-term	Ministry of Public Administration	All Ministries	**In Progress**	Draft on performance based evaluation sytem has been prepared.	Interview
3	Regular submission of income and asset statements to specified authorities	Report on asset and liabilty statements submitted	Short-term	Ministry of Public Administration	Relevant Ministries/ Divisions	**In Progress**	Civil servants are obliged to submit income and asset statements once in evey five years since 2008. Consolidated report on asset and liabilty statements submitted by public servents in 2009 is made avialble now, while December 2012 was due to submit the same for another term. Many civil executives are yet to submit their income and asset statements for this term.	Report and Interview

4	Establishment of information and communication technology (ICT) Infrastructure for introduction of e-governance	a) ICT introduced and used in all Ministries/ Divisions; b) volume and quality of public service increased and improved by ICT use	Short-term	Ministry of Information and Communication Technology	Cabinet Division	**Achieved**	Seperate website has been developed for every Ministry/ Division, email ID has been created for all officers, and information, reports, laws, rules and circulars are made available on website Volume and quality of public service are increasing and improving by use of ICT	Website visit and interview
5	Introduction of Complaint Management System	Each public office has a grievance handling 'focal point' and is publicly known	Short-term	Cabinet Division	All Ministries	**Achieved**	Manually since 2009 Introduction of ICT-based sytem since 2011	Report, circular and Interview
6	Establishment of separate agency for investigation of cases	Law published in the official Gazette	Short-term	Ministry of Home Affairs	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division, Ministry of Public Administration, Finance Division	**In Progress**	A Criminal Investigation Department (CID) is already in existence Almost in every police station, there is a seperate Inspector for investigation	interview
7	Strict prevention of adulteration of food and goods	Adulteration Act enforced	Short-term and continuous	BSTI	Ministry of Home Affairs	**In Progress**	Executive magistrates need to be empowered for this purpose	Interview

8	Enactment of Civil Service Act	Civil Service law enacted	Medium-term	Ministry of Public Administration	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	**In Progress**	Draft has been prepared by the concerned Ministry.	Interview
9	Formulation of Career Development Plan	Career Plan formulated; transparency established and fairness ensured in promotion	Medium-term	Ministry of Public Administration	Cabinet Division	**Not Achieved**	Subject to be followed by the said Act.	Interview
10	Modernisation of land management and implementation of Land Use Plan	Digitised land management system established	Medium-term	Ministry of Land	Ministry of Public Administration	**In Progress**	A pilot progrmmge is ongoing in Savar Upazila under Dhaka district.	Interview
11	Better pay and facilities for officers and employees	Establishment of permanent Pay and Service Commission	Long-term	Finance Division	Cabinet Division	**Not Achieved**	No permanent Pay and Service Commission is in operation. Time to time goverment forms temporary Pay Commission	Interview
12	Clustering of Ministries/ Divisions	Ministries/ Divisions divided in clusters, gazette notification issued	Long-term	Ministry of Public Administration	All Ministries	**Not Achieved**	Subject to be followed by the PSA. The Act is under process of formulation.	Interview

2. The Parliament

49.   NIS goal in relation to *the Parliament* is to make the parliamentary democratic system consolidated by reflecting the aspirations of the people through enactment of laws and oversight functions. Given this goal NIS identifies some short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the Parliament*. Important progresses made so far with those recommendations are noted hereunder:

Participation in the Parliamentary Standing Committee

50.   Study reveals that all 51 standing committees have been formed in the 9th Parliament in pursuance of the Constitutional provisions and the Rules of Procedure of Parliament, and in consultation with the opposition parties. Most of the committees, partcularly important ones, for

instance, Public Accounts Committee, Public Undertakings Committee and Public Estimates Committee, were consituted during the 1st session of the current parliament. The number of members from the opposition bench is determined based on the proportion in the parliement membership.

51.   Most importantly, members of the opposition bench are extending their cooperation for the standing committee functioning unlike in the parliament sessions. One political leader opined - "*Standing committees are important for parliamentary democracy and ensuring accountability of the* governance *and administration. Regardless of political position, committee members are sincere in discharging their public responsibility and running oversight* functions *effectively.*"

52.   Study reveals that no Minister can chair any committee, and certain amendments are enforced regarding the selection of members for the standing committees so as to avoid conflict of interest, for example, an MP involved with export business cannot be a part of the committee that works on this issue.

Answerability of the Executive Organ to the Parliament

53.   The Question and Answer sessions are making the Executive Organ accountable to the Parliament. According to the indepth-interview of the focal point of ethics committeee of the Parliament Secretariat, question and answer sessions are regularly held in the 9th national Parliament. On every session-day, the 1st one hour is spent for questing and ministerial responses, while, in addtion, on Wednesdays, the 1st half an hour is spent for questing and prime ministerial responses, then the next one hour is spent for questing and ministerial responses.

54.   During question-answer sessions, allocation of reasonable time is made for all MPs including the MPs of the opposition in accordance with the Rules of Procedure of the Parliament. In fact, MPs need to notify the Paliament Secretariat of their questions at least 15 days ahead.

Capacity Building of the MPs

55.   The study reveals that the capacity enhancement of MPs and Parliament Secretariat in legislative, oversight and budget-related functions is smoothly going on. With regrard to this, implementation of WB-supported Strengthening Parliamentary Oversight (SPO) Project and that of UNDP-supported Improving Democracy through Parliamentary Development (IPD) project are in progress. In addtion, Budget Analysis and Monitoring Unit is proactive, and a Help Desk has been established in the Parliament. There are also provisions for pre-budget and budget reviews, participatory budget exercise, for instance, pilot district budget in Tangail, Chanel- i farmers' budget, and civil society initiatives. Moreover, there are scopes of overseas visits and participation at national and international workshops.

56.   The Parliament must substantively and functionally carry out rational practices. The common legislative mechanisms to ensure governmental accountability are conventions of

ministerial responsibility, legislative debates, parliamentary questioning and committee sytem. Under a positive orientation and democratic supervision, Parliament can be the best anti-corruption institution. The above analysis has been made possible through literature review, visit to parliament secretariat and in-depth interview. Further to this outcome analysis, *table 3.2* shows the comprehensive picture of the implementation progress of *Action Plan* in relation to recommendations made for *the Parliament.*

Table 3. 2 The Parliament: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicator	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Progress	Remarks	Source
1	During the question-answer sessions of Prime Minister/ Minister, allocation of reasonable time for MPs of the opposition in accordance with the Rules of Procedure of the Parliament	In the question-answer sessions of Prime Minister/ Minister, participation of MPs of the opposition bench increased	Continuous	Speaker	Ministers	**Achieved**	This exercise continues regularly On every session day, 1st one hour is spent for questioning and ministerial responses on Wednesdays, 1st half an hour is spent for questioning and Prime Ministerial responses, then one hour is spent for questioning and ministerial responses	Media Observation and Interview
2	Taking steps to ensure regular participation of the MPs of the opposition in Parliamentary sessions	Legal reforms undertaken to ensure regular participation of MPs of the opposition in Parliament sessions; culture of regular participation developed	Continuous and long-term	Speaker; Leader of the House	Leader of the Opposition in the Parliament	**Not Achieved**	Culture of continuous non-participation of the opposition bench developed	Media Observation and Interview
3	Enhancing effectiveness of the Petition Committee of the Parliament	Meeting of the Committee held regularly	Continuous	Parliament Secretariat		**Not Achieved**	No meeting held during the tenure of the 9th National Parliament	Interview

4	In accordance with Constitutional provisions and the Rules of Procedure of Parliament, holding of regular meetings of the 'Public Accounts Committee'	Meetings held as per provision	Continuous; all sessions	Public Accounts Committee		**Achieved**	Meeting of the *Public Accounts Committee* held regularly Public Accounts Committee already held more than 100 meetings. No Minister can chair a Standing Committee Committee reviews audit objections placed to the Parliment, and recommends actions to be taken by the concerned ministry or authority Concerned ministry/authority is asked to submit follow-up or progress reports to Standing Committees	Office memo, Progress Reports and Interview

| 5 | Holding of regular meetings of 'Parliamentary Standing Committees' | Monthly meetings held; reports on recommendations and continuous follow-up actions | Continuous | Chairs of Standing Committees | Member s of Standing Committees,C& AG, concerned Ministry | **Achieved** | Meetings of *Parliamentary Standing Committees* held regularly

A total of 51 Standing Committees formed in the 9th National Parliament

The number of members from the opposition bench is determined based on the proportion in the Parliament membership

No Minister can chair the Committee

Committees review concerned issues, and recommend actions to be taken by the concerned ministry or authority | List of committeees, office memo and Interview |

| 6 | Capacity enhancement of MPs and Officials of Parliament Secretariat in overseeing budgeting process and organisation of Financial Oversight Committees' meetings | Budget Oversight Unit

Operational in Parliament Secretariat; training courses/ workshops organised for MPs and Officials of Parliament Secretariat | Continuous | Parliament Secretariat | Finance Division, Ministry of Planning, Comptroller and Auditor–General | **Achieved** | WB-supported Strenthening Parliamentary Oversight (SPO) Project and UNDP-supported Improving Democracy through Parliamentary Development (IPD) Project are operational in the Parliament.

Budget Analysis and Monitoring Unit is in operation.

Help-desk is established.

Provision made for pre-budget and budget reviews.

Parcipatory budget exercising, for instance, pilot district budget in Tangail, Chanel I farmers' budget, and civil society initiatives etc. could be seen.

Extended scope of overseas visits and participation at national and international workshops are available. | Project Documents, office Memo and interview |

7	Providing support to Standing Committees in terms of personnel, logistics and office space	Personnel, logistics and office space made available as per demand of standing committees	Continuous	Parliament Secretariat	M/o Public Administration, Finance Division	**In Progress**	Number of sections are increased from 15 to 22 so as to help committees function well, but it led to accomodation crisis New staff members are being recruited Provision made for in-house and expert trainings and workshops Suffcent logistic support is made available	Interview
8	Use of ICT in National Parliament and Parliamentary processes	E-Parliamentary system introduced; All laws, rules and circulars made availab le on website and preserved in archives	Continuous	Parliament Secretariat	M/o Information and Communication Technology, Finance Division	**Achieved**	Website developed and regularly updated, for instnce, laws, rules and circulars available on website. Email IDs have been created for all Parliament Members. Laptop/desktop provided to all Parliament Members ICT trainings provided to all Parliament Members	Website vist and Interview

9	In pursuance of the Constitutional provisions and the Rules of Procedure of Parliament, formation of Parliamentary Committees in consultation with the opposition parties at the first meeting of the Parliament	After next election, formation of all Parliamentary Committees to be completed during the 1st session	First Session of the new Parliament	Speaker; Leader of the House	Parliamentary leaders of the political parties, Leader of the opposition parties in the Parliament	**In Progress**	Already all Parliamentary Committees formed, most of them constituted during the 1st session of the current Parliament The number of members from the opposition bench is determined based on the proportion in the Parliement membership However, as far as indicator is concerned, sustainability of this intervention depends on the next Parliament	List of Comitteees and Interview
10	Provision for public access to information on assets owned by MPs	Asset statements of MPs made open to public during the 1st session of the Parliament	Long-term	Speaker	MPs, Leaders of the political parties represented in the Parliament	**Not Achieved**	No initiative taken so far	Interview
11	Formulation of Conduct Rules for the MPs to ensure their responsibility and accountability to the citizens	Conduct Rules for the MPs prepared and followed	Long-term	National Parliament		**Not Achieved**	No initiative taken so far	Interview

3. The Judiciary

57.   NIS goal in relation to *the Judiciary* is to establish it as a neutral, independent, and effective organ of the State. Given this goal, NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the Judiciary*. Some of the important progresses made so far with those recommendations are noted hereunder:

Introduction of Alternative Dispute Resolution

58.   The use of ADR in general civil suits started under the Code of Civil Procedure (CPC) Amendment Act, 2003 with addition of Section 89A and 89B containing the provisions for mediation and arbitration and with further amendment in 2006 added Section 89C creating scope for mediation at appellate stage. Under the above laws, opting for ADR is a voluntary provision. But in 2012, the government amended the CPC again making provisions for out-of-court settlement of lawsuits mandatory.   However, in criminal cases ADR is not well recognised in the country but Section 345 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1898 provides for compounding of offences without plea bargaining.

59.   Some Civil Society Organisations welcomed this approach and would help the court increase the number of resolutions. The ADR system can help mitigate conflicts out of the court and provide benefit both to the judiciary by reducing the backlog of case, and the people by providing faster and acceptable results.

Formulation of clear definition of   'Contempt of Court'

60.   The Jatiya Sangsad passed the Contempt of Courts Bill, 2013 on 19th February 2013 with a clear definition of the offence of contempt of court. The bill has become a law after getting the assent from the President. The new law has replaced the Contempt of Courts Act of 1926. Eminent citizens face frequent contempt of court charges on 'trifle' matters, said lawyers. The new law provides for imprisonment extending to six months or a fine extending to Tk 2,000, or both, as punishment for contempt of court. Unconditional apology from an accused could be accepted by a court. The law would allow the media to publish 'objective and unbiased' news of court proceedings.

61.   The above analysis has been made possible through literature review and in-depth interview of concerned high officials of the government. Further to this outcome analysis, *table 3.3* shows the comprehensive picture of the implementation progress of *Action Plan* in relation to recommendations made for *the Judiciary.*

Table 3.3 The Judiciary: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Organisation of training programmes and other activities for capacity development of judicial officers and strengthening of 'Judicial Administration Training Institute(JATI)'	Report on training and capacity development	Short-term and continuous	Judicial Administration Training Institute, Law and Justice Division	Supreme Court, M/o Public Administration, Finance Division	**Achieved**	JATI runs 60-day Basic Course for newly-appointed Assistant Judges, 21-day Courses (and sometimes, 3-day short courses) for Senior Assistant Judges, Joint District Judges and District Judges Report on performance of training programmes is made available and their impact on capacity development is significant	Report and interview
2	Strengthening Registrar's Office	Improvement in the quality of services in Registrar's Office	Short-term	Law and Justice Division	M/o Public Administration, Finance Division	**In Progress**	UNDP-supportedd Judicial Strengthening (JUST) project is operational for strengtening judicial sytem including improvement in the speed and quality of services in the Registrar's Office	Review project document and interview
3	Formulation and implementation of rules, guidelines and procedures for making the Supreme Judicial Council operational	Rules, guidelines and procedures for the Supreme Judicial Council formulated	Short-term	Law and Justice Division	Supreme Court	**Not Achieved**	Yet to be formulated	Interview

4	Accept Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) system	Number of alternative dispute resolutions increased	Continuous	Law and Justice Division		**Achieved**	Law enacted in 2012 and being implemented Now ADR is compulsory for lower courts Civil Society welcomed this approch and would help the court increase number of resolutions	Interview
5	Formulation of Act/ Rules/ Guidelines for appointment of Judges in the Supreme Court	Act/ Rule/ Guidelines formulated	Medium-term	Law and Justice Division	Supreme Court	**In Progress**	One of the priorities with regard to NIS implementation as identified at the first meeting of NIAC held on 28 March 2013 was to develop law/rules/ guidelines for appointment of Judges in the Supreme Court	NIAC Meeting Resolution
6	Submission of asset statements by judicial officers and employees to specified authorities annually, in accordance with relevant rules	Statements submitted and report prepared	Medium-term	Law and Justice Division	Supreme Court	**In Progress**	Regarding submission of asset statements, positive improvement is noticed in the case of hieghier courts only Implemented for lower court judges since 2008	Interview
7	Formulation of definition of 'contempt of court'	Definition of 'contempt of court' formulated.	Medium-term	Law and Justice Division		**Achieved**	On 19 February 2013 the Jatiya Sangsad passed the Contempt of Courts Bill, 2013 with a clear definition of the offence of contempt of court	Media Observa-tiona nd Interview

8	Appointment of additional judicial officers on the basis of actual need	Improvement in judge-case ratio	Long-term	Law and Justice Division, Judicial Commission	M/o Public Administration, Finance Division	**In Progress**	Many additional Judges were recruited for both lower and higher courts. For example, 39 Additional Judgeshave been appointed to the High Court Division and 10 elevated to the Appellate Division of the Supreme Court since 2009.	Factual observation and interview
9	Fixation of time limit for disposal of civil suits	Average time of disposal of civil suits reduced	Long-term	Law and Justice Division		**In Progress**	No study report is made available Interviews indicate that average time for disposal of civil suits is reducing ADR is playing vital role in reducing the backlog of cases In the current system there is a time bar, but this is not compulsory to follow.	Interview

4. The Election Commission

62.   NIS goal in relation to *the Election Commission* is to uphold it as an effective and credible institution for conducting free, fair, neutral and credible elections. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the Election Commission.* Some of the important progresses made so far with those recommendations are noted hereunder:

Approved Organogram

63.   Organisation structure was reformed and approved by the Government. The new structrure was introduced in November 2011. Given the changing notions, the EC, however, can make further amendments or additions to the current organogram of the institution.

Strengthening Election Commission

64.   The current study reveals that in order to store and manage the database of election, and to speed up sharing of information among the officials, the EC has established a server station under a project named *Construction of Server Stations for Electoral Database.* In addtion, the Election Commission undertook *Strengthening Election Management in Bangladesh (SEMB) project* with the support of UNDP and other development partners for strengthening and institutionalising the election management system and improving transparency and accountability of holding elections.

65. Further to this outcome analysis, *table 3.4* shows a comprehensive picture of the implementation progress of *action plan* in relation to recommendations made for *the Election Commission.*

Table 3.4 The Election Commission (EC) : Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Setting up of effective server stations and database disaster recovery centres in all districts and *Upazilas* and at regional levels, and opening of an election resource centre in Dhaka	Effective server stations and database disaster recovery centres operational in all districts and *Upazilas* and at regional levels, and election resource centre opened in Dhaka	Short-term	Bangladesh Election Commission	Cabinet Division	**Partially Achieved**	Effective server stations operational in all Districts and Upazilas. A total of 389, out of 479 server stations at Upazila, Zila and regional levels have already been constructed. Database recovery centres : one established in Dhaka, and establishment of another is in progress Election resource centre is likely to be established in Dhaka	Interview
2	Implementation of programmes for raising awareness of the election facilitators, voters and candidates	Target population made aware of their rights	Short-tem	Bangladesh Election Commission	Cabinet Division	**Achieved**	Awareness campaigns/programs are ongoing to make target population aware of their rights in favour of free and fair election	Interview
3	Establishment and strengthening of Bangladesh Election Commission Training Institute and its well decoration	Trained trainers and adequate training materials made available	Short-term	Bangladesh Election Commission	Cabinet Division	**Achieved**	Election Commission Training Institute is likely to be shifted at own building soon Trained trainers and adequate training materials are made available	Interview

4	Capacity development of election officials	All employees of Election Commission Secretariat and field level trained in election management	Continuous	Bangladesh Election Commission	Cabinet Division	**Achieved**	Employees of Election Commission Secretariat and field level are getting training regularly in election management Some opportunities of overseas training workshops are evident EC has own training institute with expert trainers and qualified facilitators	Interview
5	Promulgation of draft Act/ rules/guidelines on the appointment of Commissioners and their entitlements	Legal proposal submitted to the Parliament	Medium-term	Bangladesh Election Commission, Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs	Cabinet Division	**In Progress**	Draft prepared	Interview
6	Strengthening organisational structure of EC	An organisational structure proposed for Government's consideration	Medium-term	Bangladesh Election Commission, M/o Public Administration	Cabinet Division	**Achieved**	Organisation structure reformed and new structrure introduced in November 2011 Major changes made in Election Act	Report and interview
7	Amendment of the law regarding disposal of election disputes; strengthening of Election Tribunals	Election disputes disposed of at the quickest possible time	Medium-term	Bangladesh Election Commission	Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs	**Achieved**	Adequate amendment of the law regarding disposal of election disputes made since 2008 Election disputes disposed off in relatively shorter period	Interview

5. The Attorney-General

66.   NIS goal in relation to *the Attorney-General* is to develop the office of the Attorney-General as an independent and efficient institution for upholding the Constitution, the judicial system and public interest. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term

recommendations for *the Attorney-General*. The progress and outcome made so far with those recommendations are noted at outcome analysis and table hereunder:

Outcome Analysis

67.   The office of the Attorney General deals with legal matters and is entrusted with the responsibility of giving legal advice to the Government and to plead Government cases before the Court. The nature of the work is highly professional. The Attorney General is expected to play an important role in ensuring rule of law and promoting fairness and justice. As the Constitutional position holder and the highest law officer, the Attorney General is expected to act with integrity, fairness and transparency. Otherwise his/her role and attitudes may make negative impact to the delivery of justice in the higher court that may lead to loss of public confidence on the higher court and its' justice delivery system.

68.   Importantly, for all its leadership and constitutional roles to make functional with substantive integrity and functional rationality, the Attorney General office must be strenthened with legislative, administrative and logistic arrangement. The progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan andr recomendations related to the Attorney General has been documented at *table 3.5.*

Table 3.5 The Attorney-General (AG) : Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Enhancing scope for legal aid services to the poor people	Increased number of poor citizens receive legal aid	Short, medium and long-terms	AG's Office, Law and Justice Division	Finance Division	**Achieved**	A Legal Aid Unit is established at every District Court under Law and Justice Division ADR law approved and positions of legal aid officers for all districts were created in 2012 Civil Society Organisations are extending cooperation	Interview, office memo and law review
2	Step taken on capacity development of law officers	Trained and highly efficient law officers	Short, medium and long-terms	AG's Office, Law and Justice Division	M/o Public Administration, Judicial Administration Training Institute	**In Progress**	IT and ICT traianings are provided under UNDP-supported Access to Justice (A2J) project	Interview

#								
3	Reorganisation of the Attorney-General's Office by creating specialised units like writ, civil and criminal units	AG's Office has separate units for writ, civil and criminal cases.	Medium-term	AG's Office	Law and Justice Division	**Not Achieved**	No visible action is evident	Interview
4	Promulgation of Attorney Services Act	Attorney Services Act passed	Medium-term	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	Office of the AG, Law and Justice Division	**In Progress**	A draft bill was proposed during the regime of the last caretaker government but subsequently not ratified by the current Parliament\n\nCreation of district legal aid unit, appointment of district legal aid officers and operation of ADR are evident\n\nFirst NIAC meeting under the Chairmanship of the Hon'ble PM has decided to create provision of Attorney Services at a smaller scale. Law and Justice Division is working on it.	Interview and factual observation
5	Makingtenure-based appointments of the Attorney-General, Additional, Deputy and Assistant Attorneys- (say, five years)	Appointments made on the basis of the provisions in the proposed Attorney Services Act	Medium-term	Law and Justice Division		**In Progress**	First NIAC meeting has created an opportunity to look into the matter further. Law and Justice Division is working on it.	Interview

6. The Public Service Commission

69.   NIS goal in relation to *the Public Service Commission* is to develop it as an effective, modern and professional organisation capable of selecting suitable persons for appointment to the services of the Republic and advising the President on any matter connected with its functions. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the Public Service Commission.* The progress and outcome made so far with those recommendations are noted at outcome analysis and table hereunder:

70.   The Commission is responsible for upholding merit in the staffing system of Bangladesh Civil service. It is primarily responsible for laying the foundation of the civil service through fair recruitment and selection of civil service officials who ultimately shoulder the responsibility of ensuring good governance. This is why effectiveness, efficiency, accountability and transparency of BPSC are of utmost importance. In order to make it a centre of excellence, reform in its management and functions are imperative.

71.   Given the NIS purpose for the Public Service Commission and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and/or recommendations related to the PSC has been documented at *table 3.6*.

Table 3. 6 Public Service Commission (PSC): Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Policy Initiatives for increasing autonomy of PSC with regard to financial and management matters	Entitlement of PSC with regards to its specific facilities and obtaining budget as well as capability achievement for management of deligated affairs	Short-term	Cabinet Division and M/o Public Administration	PSC	**Not Achieved**	PSC needs to take consent of Finance Division in spending from appoved budget However, in recruitment matters PSC is fully independent	Interview
2	Extending need-based training on modern recruitment system by PSC	Need assessment completed, Training Plan formulated, Plan implemented	Short-term	PSC	M/o Public Administration	**Not Achieved**	No need assessment study conducted No training plan formulated Very limited staff training opportunity is available.	Interview
3	Formulation of Policy for appointment of PSC Chairman and Members and making appointments on the basis of that policy	Policy regarding appointment of PSC Chairman and the Members approved by the President	Medium-term	President**'s Office**	PSC	**Not Achieved**	No feasible progress is evident A UNDP-supported project study proposes a fair selection process of the chairman and members Goverment is yet to form a search committee	Interview

#	Recommendation	Indicator	Term	Lead	Other	Status	Observation	Source
4	Introduction of ICT-based examination system	Completion of the process of public examinations within 9-12 months	Medium-term	PSC	M/o Public Administration	**In Progress**	On-line registration system introduced Results are made available on website An ICT-based examination system is yet be introduced	Interview
5	Preparation of a standard Manual for conducting *viva-voce* examinations and following the Manual	Achievement of objectivity in the *viva-voce* examination	Medium-term	PSC	M/o Public Administration	**In Progress**	Consulting serivice support was provided by ADB to address the issue back in 2010. PSC is yet to prepare a standard manual as expected.	Interview
6	Development and implementation of a clearer criteria for promotion of officers and employees	Promotion criteria introduced and implemented by PSC	Medium-term	PSC	M/o Public Administration	**Achieved**	Specific criteria for promotion of officers and employees are inbuilt in the Empoyment and Service Rule and duly followed	Interview
7	Greater emphasis on merit and rationalising the quota system	Proportion of appointments based on merit increased	Step by step and long -term	PSC	M/o Public Administration	**Not Achieved**	Present sytem allows 45% merit, 30% children of freedom fighters, 10% women, 10% district and 5% tribal quota FGDs indicate that merit quota needs to be at least 60% so as to ensure merit based recruitment system	Interview and FGDs
8	Establishment of more than one PSC	More than one PSC established	Lon- term	M/o Public Administration	Cabinet Division, PSC	**Not Achieved**	No progress is observed regarding the establishment of second PSC apart from a discussion whether to create a separate Commission for education service	Interview

7. The Comptroller and Auditor-General

72.   NIS goal in relation to *the Comptroller and Auditor-General* is to establish the Office of the C&AG as an effective institution for ensuring financial accountability of all Government organisations. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for

the Comptroller and Auditor-General. Some of the important progresses made so far with these recommendations and a brief outcome analysis are noted hereunder:

Undertake a Crash Programme to Cover Backlog of Audits

73.   Of late, no backlog of audit objections regarding parliamentary reporting is observed. Reports are submitted to the Parliament within the stipulated time.

Implementation of Sanction Scheme and Publication of Audit Report

74.   According to   C&AG officials, response of the audited organisations have <u>been</u> significantly incresed over the last five years.

Strengthening Office of the C&AG

75.   Strengthening the Office of the C&AG requires passing of the Audit Act, the draft of which was sent to the Finance Division in October 2008. It was already reviewed by the concerned Parliamentary Standing Committee and sent to the Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division of the Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs.

Outcome Analysis

76.   Fighting corruption is highly correlated with professional handling of audit cases. In order to develop the professional integrity of public servents and enhance their sense of value for public money, the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor-General can volunteer to open its reports to public officials and citizens. Such voluntary actions help build media partnership, generate both civic eduaction and public awareness, and explain to public officials how they are individually fit into their sectors.

77.   Further to the analysis   above, ***table 3.7*** shows a comprehensive picture of the implementation progress of *action plan* in relation to NIS recommendations made for *the C&AG.*

Table 3.7 The Comptroller and Auditor-General: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Measures seeking compliance of audit observations and recommendations in time by audited organisations through implementing sanctions	Responses of the audited organisations in time and application of sanctions by the Government for non-compliance	Short-term	Office of the C&AG, Finance Division	All Government offices	**In Progress**	Responses of audited organisations have significantly increased over the last five years C&AG does not have any legal authority of imposing sanctions for non-compliance	Interview

2	Formulation of Work Plan for efficiency enhancement of 'Social Performance Audit' to ensure 'value for money'	Work Plan formulated	Short-term	Office of the C&AG	Finance Division	**In Progress**	Given the C&AG strategic plan 2013-17, *Social Performance Audit gets high priority in the following years;* 2013-2014 Social Performance Audit Work Plan is underway	Interview
3	Undertake administrative measures to make the Office of the C&AG financially, administratively and technically more autonomous	Audit Act passed by the Parliament	Medium-term	Office of the C&AG, Finance Division	Ministry of Public Administration	**In Progress**	In October 2008 Draft Audit Act sent to Finace Division Review took place by concerned parliamentary committee; draft sent to the Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division for vetting	Interview
4	Undertake a crash programme to cover backlog of audits	Reports submitted within accepted and stipulated time	Short-term	Office of the C&AG & Public Accounts Committee	All Government offices	**Achieved**	Backlog of audits/audit objections regarding parliamentary reporting reduced, and reports submitted there within stipulated time Backlog of audits/audit objections with regards to next stage objections made by the audit inspections are significantly reducing However, new list of backlog of audits is also significantly increasing, institutional capacity reforms of C&AG office is required to reduce this.	Report and interview

| 5 | Introduction and establishment of 'technical auditing' and 'performance auditing' by the Office of the C&AG in line with international best practices | 'Technical auditing' and `performance auditing' put in place | Medium-term | Office of the C&AG | All Government offices | **In Progress** | There is a Performance Audit Cell at the office of C&AG

Technical auditing, an evolving aspect for C&AG office, requires further institutional capacity building support, for instance, appointment of subject-matter specialists and provision of competency training etc. | Interview |
| 6 | Gradual separation of Audit and Accounts functions | Accounts and Audits organised as separate functions | Medium-term | Office of the C&AG | Finance Division | **Not Achieved** | No significant progress is noticed with regard to separation of Audit and Accounts functions | Interview |

8. The Ombudsman

78.   NIS goal in relation to *the Ombudsman* is to establish an effective office for this position. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the Ombudsman.*

79.   Progress made in the implementation of NIS recomendations related to the Ombudsman is insignificant (see ***table 3.8***) as the Government is yet to appoint the Ombudsman. However, one of the priorities set forth with regards to NIS implementation as identified at the first meeting of NIAC is to appoint Ombudsman and establish an office for the same.

Table 3.8 The Ombudsman: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

SI No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Appointment of Ombudsman and recruitment of necessary employees	Ombudsman appointed and employees recruited	Short-term	Parliament	Parliament Secretariat	**In Progress**	The first meeting of NIAC on 28th March 2013 prioritised agenda to appoint Ombudsman and establish office for the same	Review of meeting minutes

2	Setting up of the Office of Ombudsman and allocation of necessary resources and logistics for its Dhaka and regional offices	Ombudsman's Office and its regional offices established with necessary resources and logistics	Short-term	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	Parliament Secretariat	**Not Achieved**	Implementation will follow after the appointment of Ombudsman is made and office established for the same	Observation
3	Framing of Rules, and procedures for the Office of Ombudsman	Rules and procedures framed	Medium-term	Parliament Secretariat	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	**Not Achieved**	Progress yet to be made	Observation
4	Review of the functions of the Office of the Ombudsman and make recommendations for change	Report with recommendations prepared	Medium-term	Ombudsman	Parliament Secretariat, Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	**Not Achieved**	Implementation will follow after the appointment of the Ombudsman is made	Observation

9. The Anti-Corruption Commission

80.   NIS goal in relation to *the Anti-Corruption Commission(ACC)* is to facilitate it to emerge as an effective organisation for prevention of corruption. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the ACC.* Some of the important progresses made so far with these recommendations are noted hereunder:

Initiatives for Raising Awareness

81.   Effective anti-corruption movements with regard to media and education or faith-based institution and engagement with civil society participation are so far evident. Civic education campaign is also visible.

Training programmes and Other Activities for Capacity Development

82.   Training opportunity for capacity development of the Commission and its personnel seems to be adequate. Foreign experts/consultants facilitate the training programmes. ACC and its personnel have opportunity to participate in international seminars/workshops on pertinent issues.

Taking Effective Measures Against Money laundering

83.   Prevention of Money-Laundering Act, 2012 was passed to prevent domestic and inter-country laundering of money. The Anti-Corruption Commission is playing the most important role in enforcing this Act. Banking sector is increasingly helping here. Media observation supports that incidences of money laundering have been decreased.

84. The aforementioned analysis has been made possible though lierature review and in-depth interview of a concerned ACC official. Further to this outcome analysis, *table 3.9* shows a comprehensive picture of the implementation progress of *action plan* in relation to recommendations made for *the ACC.*

Table 3. 9 Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC) : Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	Remarks	Source
1	Capacity development of the ACC by reforming the legal structure and providing full independence with respect to investigation	Existing law amended	Short-term	ACC	Cabinet Division	**Not Achieved**	ACC is independent by its 2004 Act. It could be strengthened further by amending the Act. Amendments drafted by the ACC in 2009, now it is under further parliamentary review and approval. Since ACC has to inquire, investigate, lodge and pursue administrative and financial corruption cases at home and abroad, its capacity needs to be developed and its independence needs to be ensured. At the same time, its accountability and objectivity need to be ensured; laws should be promulgated addressing the said needs or issues.	Interview and NIS

2	Improvement of intitutional communication between the ACC and other organisations	On demand, ACC speedily gets information from other organisations	Short-term	ACC	Cabinet Division, other relevant organisations	**In Progress**	Given the performance indicator, this task is acomplished as ACC gets information from other organisations as and when required FGDs, however, reveal that this is the result of supply side response, while ACC still lacks strong initiatives for building institutional partnership with other national integrity agencies and establishing ample link with other commissions	Interview and FGDs
3	Formation and strengthening of National Integrity Unit and 'Ethics Committees' to reduce corruption	Integrity strategy implementation units formed and made effective as per National Integrity Strategy	Short-term	Cabinet Division	ACC	**In Progress**	National Integrity Implementation Unit has been funtional since the approval of the NIS headed by the Additional Secretary of Administrative Reforms and Implementation Wing of the Cabinet Division under the supervision of the Cabinet Secretary Recently letter issued by National Integrity Implementation Unit to the Ministries/Divisions and Constitutional and Statutory Bodies mentioned in the NIS for formation of ethics committees Most of the Ministries have formed ethics committees.	Interview

4	Establishment of Monitoring Cell for monitoring corruption of people engaged in prevention of corruption	Monitoring Cell established	Short-term	Cabinet Division	ACC	**Not Achieved**	Monitoring Cell is yet to be established for monitoring corruption of people engaged in prevention of corruption No progress noticed	Interview
5	Motivate political leaders including people's representatives to participate in anti-corruption programmes	Political leaders and representatives actively participate in anti-corruption programmes	Short-term	ACC	Cabinet Division	**In Progress**	ACC is working on it. On 1st April 2013 ACC organised a seminar on political will for fighting corruption. Hundreds of representatives from political domain and civil society partcipated in the seminar.	Interview and programme shedule
6	Taking effective measures against money laundering	Continuous implementation of 'Money-Laundering Prevention Act'	Short- term and continuous	ACC	Bangladesh Bank	**Achieved**	Money-Laundering Prevention Act, 2012 was passed to prevent domestic and inter-country laundering of money in large amounts. The Anti-Corruption Commission with the help of the banking sectors is playing important role in the implementation of this Act. Banking sector is increasingly helping here. Media evidence supports that incidences of money laundering have decreased.	Interview, media observation and NIS

| 7 | Undertaking initiatives for raising awareness among government organisations, businesses, civil society and mass media on corruption | Effective anti-corruption movement put in place | Short-term and continuous | ACC | Cabinet Division | **Achieved** | Effective anti-corruption movements with support from different corners of the society are evident in order to create public awareness against corruption; committes for prevention of corruption have already been formed in 9 city corporations, 62 districts and 421 upazila. Moreover, a total of 14,097 'Integrity Associations' have been formed at various educational institutions.Civic education campaign is visible.

ACC, however, still lacks strong initiatives for institutional partnership building with other national integrity agencies.

Inculcation of civic virtue at schools needs to be programme-based and institutionalised. | Interview, FGDs and obsetrvation |
| 8 | Implementation of training programmes and other activities for capacity development of the Commission | Training programmes formulated and implemented accordingly | Continuous | ACC | Cabinet Division | **Achieved** | Training opportunity for capacity development of the Commission and its personnel seems to be adequate.

Foreign experts/consultants facilitate training programmes

Commission and its personnel have opportunity to participate in international seminars/workshops on pertinent issues .

Already 3 officers have been internationally trained by INTERPOL. | interview |

9	Ensuring hiegher neutrality and enhancing accountability of the Commission	Existing law amended	Medium-term	ACC	Cabinet Division	**In Progress**	At present, no case is withdrawn on the ground of political consideration Anti-Corruption (Amendment) Act is under in the Parliament.	interview
10	Following of best practices, putting them into practice for bringing organisational reforms	Increased implementation of the best practices	Medium-term	ACC	Cabinet Division	**In Progress**	An international consultant has been recruited by ADB to adapt and implement the best practices at ACC. Training programmes have contributed significantly to raise efficiency of ACC.	Interview and literature review

10. Local Government Institutions

85.   NIS goal in relation to *Local Government Institutions* is to establish transparent, accountable, self-reliant and responsive LGIs. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *Local Government Institutions .*

Outcome Analysis

86.   Local government is a means of ensuring good governance for any state, particularly for achieving political, economic and social well-being of the marginal people of the state. It has been widely accepted that decentralisation can be conducive to attaining MDGs, mainly to poverty reduction, because local government institutions are assumed to have better information and higher incentives than the central government in designing and implementing policies that respond to local needs and preferences.

87.   The upazila election in early 2009 was a milestone for democratic decentralisation that is indeed a cornerstone of the Constitution of the People's Republic of Bangladesh (Talukdar 2009a). Until recent development in democracy and decentralisation, Union Perishad, to some extent, was the only devolutionary decentralised stage of the rural local government in Bangladesh though in urban areas a limited-democratic form of LGI has been in existence for years. Now we have seperate Acts/laws for all local government units.

88.   Given the NIS goal for LGIs and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and/or recomendations related to LGs have been documented at *table 3.10* .

Table 3.10 Local Government (LG): Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Clarification of roles and jurisdictions of the MPs and Government officials in the LGs (specially *Upazila and Zillla Parishad*)	Guidelines prepared	Short- term	Local Government Division	LG bodies	**Not achieved**	Provisions to some extent, in-built in the LG Acts (see Sections 24, 25, 26, 33 of the Upazila Parishad Act and Sections 30, 31, 38 and 39 of the Zila Parishad Act). LGD could help goverment formulate rules in accordance with Acts (see Section 63 of the Upazila Parishad Act and Section 73 of Zila Parishad Act). For clarification of role and jurisdictions of the MPs and Government officials in the LGs, Acts need to be amended. In such a case, responsibility goes to LGD, Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division, while support needed from Cabinet Division.	Interview and and review of Acts
2	Increasing allocation of resources in LG considering socioeconomic and geographical realities (population, area, level of development)	Increase in annual allocations	Short-term	Local Government Division	LG bodies	**Achieved**	Annual and other allocation of resources increased. Total LGI allocation in 2010-2011 BDT 25505 Million, in 2011-2012 BDT 25635 Million, and in 2012-2013 BDT 32506 Million.	Interview and review of report

3	Capacity Development of elected representatives, officers and employees of LGs	Report on training and capacity development programme outputs	Continuous	Local GovernmentDivision	Relevant Training institutions	**Achieved**	Report on capacity development and programme outputs is made available. From 2009 to 2012 total number of courses conducted 839 with spending BDT 8,32,31,750, whereas total number of trainee was 41370 as diverse LG elected representatives, officers and staffs took part. Moreover, from 2009 to 2012 a total 20 studies conducted for understanding the problems of LGIs and strengthening these institutions.	Interview and review of report
4	Expansion of the revenue base of LGs considering the income flow	LGs get scope to collect taxes in new areas, legally entitled to collect 'Sales tax', 'VAT' etc.	Medium-term	Local Government Division	LG bodies	**In Progress**	Union Parishad Model Tax Shedule was Gazetted in December 2003. Union Parishad Tax Selection and Collection Statregy was also approved in December 2003. New Union Parishad Model Tax Shedule was Gazetted in October 2012. Although Upazila, Zila, Municipality and City Corporation tax bases are somewhat well established, these need to be clearly specified like those of Union Parishad	Interview and reviewof documents

5	Citizens' activism demanding transparency and accountability of the LGs, elected representatives, officials and other employees	Organised citizens Groups submit report cards and have access to information from LGs	Medium-term	LG bodies	Civil society, Professional bodies	**In Progress**	Citizens have access to information from LGIs. Many LGIs have their own websites. Elected representatives of LGIs are innovative, transparent and accountable to the people. Participatory political process with formation of the committee system and participatory/open budgeting approach help LGIs alleviate marginalization and poverty. Citizen and civil society representatives, however, are demanding increased accountability of LG officials to the elected LG Parishads, classifying the role of MPs and LGIs, better public service delivery and improved transperancy and accountability in social safety-net programme operations.	Interview and literutre review
6	Specification of scope of work of *Zila Parishad* (ZP) and identification of ZP as the 'focal point' of LGs	Scope of work specified and identified clearly	Medium-term	Local Government Division		**Not Achieved**	No progress observed.	Interview
7	Introduction of 'Local Government Service'	Local Government Service Rules Promulgated, recruitments made aacordingly	Long-term	Local Government Division	Cabinet Division, M/o Public Administration	**Not Achieved**	So far no visible progress made.	Interview

B. <u>Non-state Institutions and Organizations</u>

11. Political Parties

89.   NIS goal in relation to *the political parties* is to establish them as democratic organisations by pursuing public interest and reflecting public aspirations. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *political parties.*

Outcome Analysis

90.   The study recongnises that political party is an instrument for promoting democratic values, building national integrity and nintegrating diverse principles, philosophy or set of beliefs in the society. Political parties have played significant roles in establishing and restoring democracy in the country.

91.   According to the NIS, the number of registered political parties in Bangladesh is 36. Politicians run the executive and legislative organs of the state after being nominated by the political parties and elected by the people. Politicians are also governing the local government institutions. For promotion of integrity in the country, it is crucially important to promote integrity in the activities of the political parties. This involves financial transparency in maintenance of party accounts, conduct of audit regarding fund management and promotion of democratic practices in organisational activities.

92.   Given the NIS purpose for the *Political Parties* and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and recomendations related to political parties have been documented at ***table 3.11***.

Table 3.11 Political Parties: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Revision of Party Constitutions in line with the 'Representation of People Order' (RPO) wherever required	All parties hold their council meetings (at central and district levels)	Short term and continuous	Political parties	Bangladesh Election Commission	**In Progress**	Most of the registered parties already revised their constitutions in line with the RPO wherever required. Same is true regarding holding of party council meetings at central and district levels.	Interview

2	Ensuring transparency in nomination of candidates and party fund management	Meetings held in respect of nomination, Council meetings held for selection of party leadership, audit reports of party-funds made available	Continuous	Political parties	Election Commission	**Achieved**	Transparency in nomination of candidates and fund management is visible in mainstream political parties. Poltical parties submit their audited fund management reports in timely manner.	Interview and FGDs
3	Enhancement of consultations of political parties with trade unions, Civil Society and professional bodies, etc.	Joint meetings held and joint activities accepted	Continuous	Political parties	Trade Unions, Civil society organisations	**Achieved**	Main political parties are increasingly focusing on consultations with trade unions, professional bodies, civil society members and so on. Main political parties have some subordinate and associated party wings and aligned professional bodies, which lead to vested political interest to organise joint meetings and make shared decisions.	Interview and FGDs
4	Formulation of 'Code of Conduct' of the political parties and its adherence	An agreed Code of Conduct prepared	Medium-term	Political parties	Election Commission	**Not achieved**	No progress noticed so far. It is important to prepare an agreed 'Code of Conduct' for political parties given the existing poltical context. This needs to be emphasised by EC and/or Parliament with effective dialogue among political parties.	Interview

12. Industrial and Commercial Organisations in the Private Sector

93.   NIS goal in relation to *Industrial and Commercial Organisations in the Private Sector* is to establish the private industrial and commercial enterprises as a transparent sector committed to socioeconomic development of the country. Given this goal NIS identifies short, medium and long-term recommendations for *the private sector.*

Outcome Analysis

94.   The study suggests that involvement of corporations in tackling corruption requires a vision-driven strategic framework allowing them to see the problem as a system-perspective, and put stress on supply , demand and social sides equally. The study reveals that corporations need to set forums and enhance understanding and consensus among themselves so that they can work more strategically and coherently and integrate activities for combatting corruption and promoting Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). In addition, the study gives emphasis on enhancing collaboration across private and public sectors and civil society for combatting corruption generating more effective and durable results.

95.   According to NIS, the contribution of the private sector in the GDP of Bangladesh is increasing significantly. Integrity of this sector is of paramount importance; it is all the more important for the welfare of and service delivery to the people. Introduction of corporate culture and its sustenance are also critically important. The culture of loan-default needs to be eliminated. 'Protection of Consumer Rights Act' has to be implemented properly. To prevent collusive and conspiratorial behaviour of business houses and control the activities of the cartels and syndicates, enforcement of 'Competition Law' can play a very important role; organisational arrangements need to be established for effective implementation of the newly-promulgated 'Competition Act'. More transparency and accountability need to be established in the banking, non-financial and financial sectors.

96.   Given the NIS mandate, the Ministry of Commerce would be responsible for reviewing and monitoring the activities with respect to integrity of the industrial establishments of the private sector through different Associations and Chambers.

97.   Given the NIS purpose for the private sector and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and/or recomendations related to industrial and commercial organisations in the private sector has been documented at *table 3.12*

.

Table 3.12 Industrial and Commercial Organisations in the Private Sector :

Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Reaching at agreement by business houses and trade unions on payment of fair and performance-based wages and benefits	Incidences of violence and conflict in the business and industrial sector decreased	Short-term and Continuous	M/o Commerce	M/o Industries, M/o Labour and Employment, Chambers and Associations	**Achieved**	Social Compliance Forum is effective and meetings of the forum areheld regularly once in every three months. A consensus between business houses especially the garments and manufacturing sector, Government and trade unions on payment of fair and performance-based wages and benefits is made effective although there are plenty of evidences of frustration at trade unions. Incidences of violence and conflict in the business and industrial sector has significantly decreased.	Interview

2	Motivate business establishments for payment of taxes appropriately and regularly and provide award to best tax payers	Payment of taxes by business establishments increased	Short term and Continuous	M/o Commerce	National Board of Revenue, Business establishments	**In Progress**	Some innovative initiatives, for instance, Tax Fair and awarding CIP status etc. are evident. However, media partnership and public awareness campaign are still limited, and the service delivery scope of NBR could be upgraded further.	FGDs and interview
3	Setting-up of legal structure for regulation of multi-level marketing business	New law promulgated and enforced	Short-term	M/o Commerce	M/o Home Affairs	**In Progress**	Law drafted, and finalised incorporating feedback obtained from stakeholder consultation meetings and review of Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division. Approved in Cabinet in principle in October 2012, now under consideration of the Parliament.	Interview and review of draft law
4	Proper enforcement of Competition Act	'National Competition Commission' established and operational	Continuous	M/o Commerce	Business Associations	**In Progress**	Competition Act is operational. Establishment of National Competition Commission is underway.	Interview and review of Act and office memeo

5	Strengthening of self-control in business	Chambers and Associations ensure compliance of rules and regulations, and take remedial measures against violators	Continuous	Chambers and Associations	Business Companies	**In Progress**	Chambers and Associations ensure compliance of rules and regulations. However, limited remedial measures are evident against violators.	Interview and FGDs
6	Strict enforcement of bankruptcy law against loan defaulters	Cases lodged and their disposal sped up	Continuous	Bangladesh Bank	Chambers and Associations, Banks and Financial Institutions	**In Progress**	Credit Information Bureau is effective, from where updated information on loan defaulters are available. Enforcement of bankruptcy law against loan defaulters is evident, but this is not strictly followed in all cases.	FGDs and interview
7	Enforcement of sanctions against violators of corporate governance	Corporate houses not complying with transparent principles are prosecuted	Continuous	Securities and Exchange Commission	Finance Division	**In Progress**	Culture of corporate governance yet to be developed. Limited and case-by-case legal actions are taken against corporate houses not complying with transparent principles.	FGDs and interview

8	Strict enforcement of Consumer Rights Protection Act	Satisfaction of consumers	Continuous	M/o Commerce	M/o Industries, Chambers and Associations	**In Progress**	Consumer Rights Protection Act, 2009 is operational Despite enforcement of the Act, consumers' satisfaction is still unmet in terms of magnitude and scale.	Interview

| 9 | Strengthening the monitoring activities of 'Micro-credit Regulatory Authority' | Enhanced transparency and accountability achieved in micro-credit operations | Continuous | Bangladesh Bank | NGO Affairs Bureau | **Achieved** | To bring Non-government Microfinance Institutions (NGO-MFIs) under a regulatory framework, the government of Bangladesh enacted 'Microcredit Regulatory Authority Act,' in July 2006.

Under this Act, the government has established a separate Microcredit Regulatory Authority and constituted its Board of Directors with the Governor of the Bangladesh Bank as the chairperson, with a view to ensuring transparency and accountability of microcredit activities of the NGOs/MFIs in the country.

Micro-credit Regulatory Authority is full-fledged in terms of delegation of power and institutional capacity, and it has achieved enhanced transparency in micro-credit operations. | FGDs and literature review |

| 10 | Strengthening the activities of 'Insurance Development and Regulatory Authority (IDRA) | Extent and transparency of Insurance activities increased | Continuous | M/o Commerce | Finance Division | **In Progress** | Transparency and activity drives of IDRA are evolving but still insufficient in terms of scale and visibility. | Interview |

13. NGOs and Civil Society

98.   NIS goal in relation to *NGOs and Civil Society* is to establish an active and accountable civil society committed to the development of people. Given this goal NIS identifies some recommendations for *the NGOs and Civil Society.*

Outcome Analysis

99.   According to NIS, Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) and NGOs are accountable to their organisational structures and processes, and ultimately they are accountable to the laws and rules of the State as well as the established norms of the society. The State provides support to their activities and intervenes in some identified areas and they also complement and supplement the Government's initiatives.

100.   NIS delineates the impotance of maintenance of neutrality, abstinence from political activities and practice of transparent fund management of NGOs. Improvements in these areas are extremely important for their proper functioning. For ensuring transparency and accountability of the NGOs, establishment of adequate legal structures, a transparent recruitment system for them, enhancement of Government's oversight capacity and avoidance of bureaucratic intricacies are critically important.

101.   Given the NIS goal for the NGOs and civil society and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and recomendations related to the Civil Society Sector has been documented at *table 3.13.*

Table 3.13 NGOs and Civil Society: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Promotion of enhanced transparency in NGO functioning	'Report Cards' of the stakeholders submitted to the NGOs and LG organisations, Annual budget published publicly, updated information provided regularly on websites of NGOs	Short-term	NGO Affairs Bureau	Ministry of LGRD&C	**Achieved**	Practice of submitting stakeholders' report cards to the NGOs and LG organisations is yet to be established, but if such reports or other study reports relevent to NGOs/CSOs/LGIs are available, they may be uploaded to the websites of NGO Affairs Bureau or Local Government Division.

Updated information made available regularly on websites of all NGOs/CSOs registered with NGO Affairs Bureu.

In addtion, NGO Affairs Bureau verifiesy/reviewes audit reports of its registered NGOs/CSOs, and makes field inspection report available to them.

NGOs/CSOs, however, rarely declare their annaul budget publicly. | Inerview and FGDs |
| 2 | Introduction of a standard accounting and monitoring system of the NGOs | Standard accounting and monitoring system introduced | Medium-term | NGOs, NGO Affairs Bureau | Supervised by PMO | **Achieved** | Standard accounting and monitoring system is established at NGOs/CSOs registered with NGO Affairs Bureau.

There are 164 enlisted Chartered Accounting Firms which help NGOs/CSOs maintain standard accounting system and get them audited regularly. | Inerview and FGDs |

3	Promulgation of necessary law/rules/policy for transparent appointments in the NGOs	Transparent appointment system followed	Medium-term	NGO Affairs Bureau	Legislative and Parliamentary Affairs Division	**Not Achieved**	No harmonised law/rules/policy is in operation for ensuring transparent appointments in the NGOs. NGOs/CSOs, registered with NGO Affairs Bureu however, have their own recruitment policies. Some of them have transparent appointment system, but in fact most of them are yet to adopt a transparent and accepted practice.	Inerview and FGDs
4	Creation of increased scope for interactions among Government and the civil society in Government's policies and other important actions	Members of the civil society and NGOs participated at organised seminars and workshops; Help government with their advice, research and intellectual iutputs	Continuous and long-term	NGO Affairs Bureau	Supervised by Prime Minister's Office (PMO)	**Achieved**	Although NGO Affairs Bureau itself organises limited number of seminars and workshops, the Government as a whole through its different Ministries/Divisions and Constitutional or statutory bodies organise seminars, worshops and symposiams to facilitate diverse level of interactions. Feedback and lessons-learnt aproach is visible.	Inerview and FGDs
5	Development of internal control system in the NGOs	Stakeholders and beneficiaries of the NGOs receive and follow appropriate and adequate information on their systems, processes and activities	Long-term	NGOs, NGO Affairs Bureau	Supervised by PMO	**In Progress**	Internal control system in the NGOs/CSOs has been signfinantly improved. Stakeholders and beneficiaries of the NGOs receive appropriate and adequate information on their systems, processes and activities, partcularly with regards to foreign-funded development projects.	Inerview

| 6 | Avoidance of duplication and overlap in the interventions of the Government and NGOs | Interventions of the Government and NGOs established as complementary activities | Long-term | NGOs, NGO Affairs Bureau | Supervised by PMO | **Achieved** | Significant progress observed over the span of last five years in avoidance of duplication and overlaping in the interventions of the Government and NGOs.

Tripartite initiatives are evident here : NGO Affairs Bureau, NGOs/CSOs and concerned Ministries make scrutiny seperately, organise consultation meetings and take joint decisions in many cases which all together lead to a congenial complementary activities. | Interview and FGDs |

14. Family

102.   NIS goal in relation to *the family* is to re-establish families as the main source of moral values. Given this goal NIS identifies some recommendations for *the family .*

Outcome Analysis

103.   According to NIS, the foundation of man's morality is based on the values earned in his or her family; the moral values people cherish and follow stem from it. Bangladesh is the seat of an age-old civilisation, and family traditions are deep-rooted here; it has influenced the lives of the people of this land for long. But presently urbanisation, globalisation, rapid development of economic life, spread of technology, specially information and communication technology (ICT), expansion of media activities, explosion of television and entertainment, globalisation of business and its fast expansion, change in the political environment, commercialisation of education etc. are influencing the culture and values of the families.

104.   Given the NIS purpose for the family and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and/or recomendations related to the family have been documented at *table 3.14.*

Table 3.14 Family: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Arrangement for exchange of views between parents and educational institutions	Meetings organised and their proceedings followed	Continuous	LG Division, M/o Education, M/o Primary and Mass Education	Parent, educational institutions and LGIs	**In Progress**	Arrangement of exchange of views between parents and educational institutions are evident, but proceedings are not always followed and recorded. This should be responsibilty of educational institutions and parents provided that LGD, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Primary and Mass Education extend support in issuing guidelines, circulars and ensure budget allocations.	FGDs with Family and School representatives
2	Encouraging and supporting the children and youths participating at voluntary, patriotic and welfare activities	Increased participation of children and youth in the activities identified	Continuous	LG Division and educational institutions	Parents, civil society, local government institutions	**In Progress**	Children and youth are partcipating at voluntary, patriotic and welfare activities. However, these could be upgraded in terms of scale and visibility. Encouraging and supporting the children and youths in participating in such activities would be responsibilty of parents, civil society organisations, NGOs, community-based organisations, local government institutions and educational institutions. Government support, directives and budget mobilisation can play a key role here.	FGDs with Family and School representatives

3	Supporting community-based child and youth-care centres on educational and professional development	Presence of the parents in the meetings and their participation	Continuous	Local Government Division	Local Government Institutions	**Not Achieved**	No progress noticed so far. Responsibilty vested on local organisations, concerned community-based child and youth care centres, local government institutions and local stakeholders including parents.	FGDs with Family and School representatives
4	Publicity and propaganda of the achievements of 'role-models'	Reports on the activities	Long-term	LG Institutions, M/o Education, M/o Cultural Affairs	Media, Civil Society	**In Progress**	No visible progress is made so far, no report on these activities is observed. Partcipants, however, praised the initiatives of involvement of the role models at the *Borno Mela* and Children Art Competition Programmes.	FGDs with Family and School representatives

15. Educational Institutions

105.   NIS goal in relation to *the educational institutions* is to make educational and religion-based institutions effective agents for promotion of morality. Given this goal NIS identifies some recommendations for *educational institutions*.

Outcome Analysis

106.   Civic education and civic virtue in schools tend to sustain anti-corruption reforms. Donors are increasingly interested in funding projects/programmes for improvement of civic education which will raise awareness against corruption and facilitate institutional reforms (Talukdar, 2009).

107.   According to NIS, there are different streams of education in Bangladesh, of which the most important ones are: mainstream vernacular education, English-medium education, and religious education in *general and kowmi madrasas*. In all systems, moral education is imparted although variation in the curricula and approach on the concept of ethics and the modalities of supervision create differences in promotion of ethics among children.

108.   Given the NIS goal for educational institutions and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and recomendations related to educational institutions has been documented at *table 3.15.*

Table 3.15 Educational Institutions: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicators	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Strengthening the ethics education programme in the primary and secondary level educational institutions	Programme of teaching of ethics conducted regularly after the event of national anthem; Boy Scouts and Girl Guides programmes implemented in all institutions	Medium-term	M/o Education, M/o Primary and Mass Education	M/o Religious Affairs	**In Progress**	Conducting ethics teaching programme after the event of national anthem is evident at primary and secondary level educational institutions even in some English medium shools. Primary schools follow the Cub Scout, secondary schools follow the Boy Scout and Girl Guide programmes.	FGDs with Family and School representatives
2	Incorporation of curricula on ethics and morality in general education and establishment of appropriate education system	Curricula on ethics and religious education introduced in the syllabus of primary and high school levels	Medium-term	M/o Education, M/o Primary and Mass Education	M/o Religious Affairs	**Achieved**	Curricula on religious education and ethics have been introduced in the syllabus of primary and high school levels. Religious courses, however, focuse on ethics and morality issues. FGD reveals that English medium schools have also introduced ethics courses like moral scince, comparartive religious studies or religious study.	FGDs with Family and School representatives
3	Supervision the activities of educational and religion-based institutions by LG representatives	LG representatives involved in supervision; Managing Committees formed with the neutral persons interested in education	Medium-term	M/o Education, M/o Primary and Mass Education	LG Division	**In Progress**	LG representatives and/or local stakeholders are involved in supervision at general educational and religion-based institutions. Managing Committees at primary level formed with neutral persons interested in education, whereas those at secondary level are yet to reach at this stage. Some English-medium schools have formed Parents-Teachers Associations instead of Managing Committees,	FGDs with Family and School representatives

4	Expansion of the stipend programme for girl students	Stipends given to increased number of girl students	Medium -term	M/o Education, M/o Primary and Mass Education	LG Division	**Achieved**	while others hold informal meetings with parents.	
							FGD partcipants observe that impact of the stipend programme for girl students in rural areas are particularly praiseworthy. They also notice that stipends are given to anincreasing number of girl students in rural areas during the rule of the current regime.	FGDs with Family and School representatives

16. Media

109.   NIS goal in relation to *the media* is to establish a free, accountable and neutral system of disemination of news as a voice of the citizens. Given this goal NIS identifies some recommendations for *the media.*

Outcome Analysis

110.   The study reveals that upholding ethical guiding principles of journalism - preserving its independence, integrity and freedom from bias in the gathering and dissemination of information and news - is really challenging but imperative for establishment of a free, accountable and neutral media as a voice of the citizens. Observations and anecdotes support that failure to establish media integrity in a society may lead to pitfalls with public integritity as influence of the media to social norms and customs building is exceptional.

111.   According to NIS, media in Bangladesh enjoy immense freedom – no restriction is imposed on them in respect of collection, selection, publication and broadcasting of news. The media owned by the Government, its television and radio channels, run their programmes by putting importance to public interest and Governments' development priorities. Through the 'Right to Information Act, 2009', journalists now have an easy access to public information.

112.   NIS has also stressed the challenge of ensuring full security of the journalists; it also needs a long period of time to achieve such an objective. Due to the very nature of the job, journalists have to work in risky and hostile situations and environment; sometimes they become victims of violence. These problems need to be addressed properly. Side by side, their accountability and professional ethics need to be promoted. It has been observed that sometimes confusing and biased news-items are disseminated, published and broadcast due to lack of neutrality and professional skills; strict objectivity has to be maintained in this regard. It is expected that, by establishing its internal control, the media would rise above personal bias and narrow business interest; thus it may play an important role in establishing a democratic society and ensuring a free flow of information.

113.   Given the NIS goal for the Media and consideration of the aforementioned outcome analysis, the progress made in the implementation of NIS action plan and/or recomendations related to the *media* has been documented at **table 3.16.**

Table 3.16 The Media: Implementation Progress of Action Plan

Sl No	Interventions	Performance Indicator	Time-frame	Responsibility of	Supported by	Implementation Status		
						Pogress	**Remarks**	**Source**
1	Promotion of integrity in the media	Code of conduct for the media workers formulated; code followed and implemented	Short- term	Media organisations	M/o Information, Press Council	**In Progress**	Bangladesh Press Council formulated a c*ode of conduct* for the media workers, which included the editorial policy as well but elctronic media was not included there. Code of conduct, however, is not being followed or implemented properly as there are limited enforcement mechanisms within the frameowork of the Press Council Act,1974 and Press Council Regulations,1980. The Press Council Act needs to be ammended; a new regulation and a comprehensive code of conduct for the mass media are to be formulated shortly. Importantly, there is an urgent call for a media policy of the Govermment, on which the Ministry of Information is currently working.	Iterview

| 2 | Introduction of transparent and fair policy for public advertising | Public advertisements distributed on the basis of open competition | Short-term | M/o Information | Media organisations, Government organisations | **In Progress** | Even though public advertisements are currently distributed on the basis of open competition, reviewing of *Public Advertisement Policy* is under consideration of the Ministry in order to make it more transparent and fair.

According to FGDs, siginificant progress has been made so far regarding this issue, but there is an urgency to review the public advertisement policy. | Iterview and FGDs |

| 3 | Strengthening of Press Council as the 'watchdog' of the media | Decisions of the Press Council regarding media implemented | Short-term and continuous | Press Council | Media organisations | **In Progress** | According to the existing Act and regulation, Bangladesh Press Council can take decisions on press media and news agency, but it does not have authority over electronic media.

Representatives of press council indicate that decisions of the Press Council regarding press media are implemented, but scope and scale of jurisdictions of the Press Council within the framework of exting law are very limited.

FGDs delineate the importance of strengthening Bangladesh Press Council though amendment of Act and formuation of new regulation in order to stop unethical journalism and to ensure freedom of press, news agency and electronic media.

FGDs and interview of the concerned representatives reveal that Press Council needs to be stenthened with sufficient logistic, huaman and financial resources, and in terms of scale, size and visibility.

FGD participants also call for a mass media policy of the government in order to help incorporate a high sense of integrirty in journalism. | Iterview and FGDs |

4	Ensuring a safe working environment for the journalists	Cases of violence against journalists reduced and eventually stopped	Short-term and continuous	M/o Home Affairs	Media organisations	**Not Achieved**	Cases of violence against journalists are yet to be reduced Ensuring full security of the journalists is a great challenge for the Ministry of Home Affairs. It needs a long period of time to achieve such an objective. However, according to FGDs, there is an increasing call for ensuring enough protection for the journalists in order to encourage them to perform their jobs without fear. Journalists should have special right to ask police protection in case **of** threats.	Iterview and FGDs
5	Enforcement of 'Right to Information Act'	Citizens and media receive relevant information from Government offices as per rules and system	Continuous	Information Commission	M/o Information and other Ministries	**Achieved**	Parliament passed the Right to Information (RTI) Act in 2009 aiming to ensure a free flow of information in the country, enforcement of which is now evident. Owing to this Act, citizens, reserchers and media have now an easy access to public information from Government offices.	Iterview and FGDs
6	Implementation of the recommendations of the 'Wage Board'	Media-workers receive pay and emoluments on the basis of Wage Board's recommendations	Medium term	Media organisations	M/o Information	**Achieved**	Earlier there was a Wage Board only for print media , which is now reorgani**s**ed and reestablished for both print and electornic media. Moreover, media workers receive pay and emoluments on the basis of the Board's recommendations.	Iterview I

| 7 | Strengthening of Information Commission | Adequate manpower and logistics provided to the Information Commission | Medium-term and continuous | M/o Information | Finance Division, M/o Public Administration | **Achieved** | A three-member Information Commission formed for effective enforcement of the Right to Information (RTI) Act, 2009. It is observed that adequate manpower and logistics have been provided to the Information Commission. | Iterview |

| 8 | Development of professional skills of the journalists in gathering, processing, disseminating and broadcasting news and information | Journalists receive training in diversified fields; dissemination and broadcasting of biased and partisan news reduced | Continuous and long-term | Media organisations | M/o Information | **Achieved** | The Press Institute of Bangladesh (PIB) regularly trains journalists to develop their professional skills in gathering, processing, disseminating and broadcasting news and information.

Bangladesh Press Council also organises national and regional worshops every year. Some initiatives of the non-governmental organisations are also evident here.

In addtion, BBC provides trainings in professional journalism and USAID-funded PROGATI in collaboration with the office of C&AG and Management and Resources Development Initiative (MRDI) organised training for business journalists in audit related activities.

Given the impact of the professional training, dissemination and broadcasting of biased and partisan news have been reduced. Nevertheless, it is still a challenge associated with promotion of integrity in the media. | Iterview and FGDs |

IV. Recommendations and Conclusion

Recommendations

114.   To make the identified national government agencies dedicated to curbing corruption, the following approaches may be undertaken:

- A broad political consensus for sustained commitment towards NIS implementation; .

- Improved media partnership and media engagement, effective dialogues in the form of seminars and roundtables with participation of political stakeholders, civil soiciety representatives, private sector, media and bureaucrats both in terms of scale and magnitude of quality and visibility.

- Consolidating the rule of law through strenthening the judiciary in terms of institutional capacity enhancement including undertaking a series of judicial studies. It may also include organization of seminars and symposiams on the role of judiciary; putting in place an elaborate system for recruitment of supreme court judges and enhanncing the judicial oversight and enforcement mechanisims, for instance and scaling up case review by the academia and the media.

115. Mainstreaming the mass media, educational institutions and the family into the process of national integrity building, fighting corruption which involve rigorous civic and parental education, community awareness, teaching civic virtue at school and media campaign programmes. Research, for instance, Gyimath-Boadi (2004:3) reveals that it is difficult to sustain anti-corruption reforms without effective public/civic education.

116.   In addtion, Information Commission and Human Rights Commission need to be incorporated in National Integrity Strategy with identifying their goals and action plans as   core national integrity agencies. The provision of integrity awards and rewarding sytem, as reflected in the National Integrity Strategy, needs to be operational in full-fledge mode.

117.   The challenge of the Ministry of Commerce entrusted with reviewing and monitoring the integrity measures of the commercial and industrial establishments of the private sector may be encouraged to engage extensively with different Associations and Chambers in the form of consultations, shared decision-making, preparation of guidelines, establishment of enforcement mechanism, policy-making and shared monitoring.

118.   The challenge of the NGO Affairs Bureau, responsible for overseeing the integrity of NGOs, may be encouraged to the extensive Civil Society consultations, shared decision-making and joint monitoring.

Conclusion

119.   The National Integrity Building is a priority of the goverment given the fact that in today's world, there are crucial links between corruption and human rights violation, poverty, exclusion, environmental degradation, vulnerability and conflict. Moreover, corruption diverts essential public resources away from their rational uses and damages development efforts that impose direct costs on society and tailor the sufferings of the mass-people.

120.   Importantly, making the state organs and constitutional as well as major statutory bodies dedicated to combating corruption requires strong political and judicial commitment, effective adjudication, social compliance and massive administrative reforms. Strong commitment of the Government is evident with the approval of the National Integrity Strategy, formation of the National Integrity Advisory Council (NIAC) as well as the Executive Committee of the National Integrity Advisory Council (ECNIAC). Collective commitment and political consensus for national integrity building are required now.

121.   To make the credible results here, the distinct national government agencies must ensure public respect and be transparent with deligated authoritry and responsive to the civic needs. In addtion, non-state institutions like political parties, industrial and commercial organisations in the private sector, NGOs and civil society, media, educational institutions, and family need to be mainstreamed in the national integrity building. Civic virtue at school, media campaign programmes, voice of the civil society, corporate compliance mechanisims and reform initiatives are indespensible to follow with.

122.   The study reveals that the NIS has successfully adressed the comprehensive and technical issues, for instance, it has put in place the legal, institutional and administrative arrangements and procedures that can enable and support transparency and accountability in public offices and institutions. In addition, the NIS has equally involved the non-state intitutions in fighting corruption given the importance of bridging leadership, rooting out corruption and tailoring sustainable results.

123.   The study also supports that NIS is a comprehensive and living strategy paper. One of its unique strengths is its flexibility – the document is allowed to be reviewed and updated time to time. NIS has intended to transform the country to a new paradigm. Functions, performance, evolution, current status and challenges for each of the identified institutions and organisations have been presented briefly in this stategy paper, and time-bound action plans have been proposed. It has also documented all necessary supportive arrangements and has given special importance to the coordination among these actions and reform initiatives to have a strong synergic effect.

124.   The progress of NIS implementation made so far is satisfatory. Indepth interviews with the senior representatives from relevent Ministries/Divisions and constitutional and statutory bodies suppported by review of office memo, meeting resolution, Acts, rules, guidelines, reports and other documents reveal that a significant progress has been made in certain areas within 6-month period since NIS got approved. We need a concerted effort to sustain the progress and move forward with further improvements.

References

Address of the Hon'ble President to the Ninth Jatiya Sangsad, 27 January 2013.

Commitment for Golden Bengal - *National Integrity Strategy*, approved in October 2012, Cabinet Divsion, The Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.

Framework of National Integrity Strategy: An Inclusive Approach to Fight Corruption- drafted in , 2008 by Preparing the Good Governance Project under Cabinet Division.

Gyimath-Boadi E. 2004. New Anti-Corruption Governments: The Challenge of Delivery – Ghana:A Case Study. *Prepared for the New Anti-Corruption Governments Meeting*, Organized by the Government of Kenya, TI-kenya and the TI Secretariat, Nairobi, October.

Hoddes R, Banfield J, Wolfe T. (eds.). 2001. *Global Corruption Report 2001*. Transparency International: Berlin.

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). 1999. *Public Sector Corruption: An International Survey of Prevention Measures.* OECD: Paris.

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development OECD (2000). *Trust in Government: ethics Measures in OECD Countries* OECD: Paris.

Talukdar, M.R.I. 2012. Mobile Communications and Fighting Corruption. *M4D 2012 International Conference Proceedings.* Karlstad :Karlstad University Studies.

Talukdar MRI. 2009a. *Rural Local Government In Bangladesh*. Osder Publications:Dhaka.

Talukdar MRI. 2009. Combating Corruption: Mechanisms and Institutional Arrangements. *The Journal of Administrative Studies.* No. 02 (June 2009):99-106

The Nielsen Company (Bangladesh) Ltd.January 2012. *Independent Expert Survey and National Perception Survey on NIS, UNCAC and Partnership Implementation.* Cabinet Division, The Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh